

necessary to refer to any of the information subject of the European Union's claim. Hence, we are not convinced that examining the European Union's claim on appeal will facilitate further the achievement of a satisfactory settlement of this dispute.

5.251. Furthermore, as mentioned in section 5.3 above, the anti-dumping measure at issue in this dispute expired on 12 November 2016.⁴¹⁷

5.252. In light of the Panel's consideration of the appropriate extent of BCI protection based upon the parties' interim review comments, the company-specific nature of the information, as well as the expiry of the measure at issue, an examination of whether the Panel should have included the information in question in the circulated version of its Report is not necessary to secure a positive solution to this dispute. For these reasons, we find it unnecessary to rule 8 696 Tm.7 (m)3oeoTj 0.004

- a. Consequently, we uphold the Panel's finding, in paragraphs 7.160 and 8.1.b.i of the

the WTO Secretariat on 11 July 2013 constituted a request to suspend the work of the Panel in the sense of Article 12.12 of the DSU.

6.9. We have also found that, in concluding that its work had not been suspended and that its authority had not lapsed, the Panel did not act inconsistently with Article 12.12 of the DSU. Moreover, we have found it unnecessary to address the European Union's claim that the Panel failed to undertake an objective assessment of the matter.

- a. Consequently, we uphold the Panel's findings, in paragraphs 7.29.b and c, and 8.1.a.ii and iii of the Panel Report that the work of the Panel was not suspended and the authority for the establishment of the Panel did not lapse.

The Panel's treatment of certain information as BCI

6.10. We find it unnecessary to rule on whether the Panel erroneously designated certain information as BCI and consequently erred by redacting that information from five paragraphs of the Panel Report.

Recommendation

6.11. For the reasons set out in this Report, the Panel's recommendation at paragraph 8.3 of the Panel Report, that the European Union bring its measures into conformity with its obligations under the Anti-Dumping Agreement, stands.

Signed in the original in Geneva this 31st day of July 2017 by:

Ricardo Ramírez-Hernández_ _ _ _ _